



Joel P. Ettinger
Executive Director

**MEETING SYNOPSIS OF THE SEPTEMBER 15, 2011
PROGRAM, FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE MEETING**

A. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Welcome and Introductions

The New York Metropolitan Transportation Council's (NYMTC) Program, Finance, and Administration Committee (PFAC) meeting was called to order by Mr. Robert Zerrillo of the New York State Department of Transportation (NYSDOT) and Chair of the Program, Finance, and Administration Committee (PFAC). The committee members introduced themselves and a quorum was declared.

Mr. Zerrillo provided the highlights of the PFAC meeting and said that special attention during the meeting would be given towards the observance of the 10th anniversary of September 11, 2001 and the September 11th Memorial Program. He then read the attached letter prepared by the NYSDOT Commissioner Joan McDonald noting the loss of NYMTC's colleagues on September 11th and expressing her thoughts on the September 11th Memorial Program for Regional Transportation Planning. Mr. Zerrillo said that the world had changed a great deal over the 10 years since the terrorist attacks of September 11, 2001.

B. OBSERVANCE OF THE TENTH ANNIVERSARY OF THE TERRORIST ATTACKS OF SEPTEMBER 11, 2001

Lou Venech on behalf of Christopher O. Ward, Executive Director, Port Authority of New York and New Jersey

Mr. Lou Venech, of the Port Authority of New York And New Jersey (PANYNJ), conveyed the regrets of Chris Ward the Executive Director of the PANYNJ, for not being able to attend the meeting. Mr. Venech, who was in the tower on the morning of September 11, 2001, conveyed his respects to the families of 84 Port Authority staff members and to the families of the three NYMTC staff. He thanked the NYMTC staffs who he said endured the tragedy and regrouped quickly in the effort to restore the transportation connection that were lost that day. He said NYMTC staff, along with the member agency staff, worked to clear obstacles to help rebuild momentum towards the recovery effort. He said that there was no loss greater than the human toll lost on that day and therefore it was fitting that the NYMTC staff chose to memorialize its losses through the September 11th Memorial Program for Regional Transportation Planning and help bring in a new generation of transportation professionals into the planning field. He said that the Port Authority was proud to help formulate the initial program and proud to be a participant.

Alice Greenwald, Director, National September 11th Memorial Museum

Ms. Alice Greenwald, Director of the National September 11th Memorial Museum provided a description of the 9/11 Memorial Museum. She said that it consisted of two reflecting pools, each an acre in size, set within the footprints of the World Trade Center (WTC) Twin Towers and each pool had 30 foot waterfalls cascading downwards on all four sides into the pool. She explained how the names of the 2,983 victims of both the 9/11 attacks and the 1993 WTC bombings were inscribed in bronze around the perimeter of the pools and how each name was arranged by layers of meaning, reflecting where people were and who they were with on September 11, 2001. She added that the names were organized into nine groups—1 for the victims of the 1993 WTC bombings, 2 for each of the twin towers, 4 for the hijacked airplanes, 1 for the pentagon, and 1 for the first responders. She said that the memorial reflected relationships that existed between the victims. She said that the Memorial Museum was a museum housed within an artifact that occupied the underground

space below the Memorial Plaza and said that the mission of the museum was to provide education, commemoration and inspiration—a story telling museum and a memorial institution. She then showed an animated brief walk-thru of what it would be like to visit the 9/11 Memorial Museum. Ms. Greenwald said that as of September 11, 2011, the 9/11 Memorial was open every day to the public and the National September 11th Memorial Museum opening day would be on September 11, 2012—“The commitment to remembrance.”

September 11th Memorial Program for Regional Transportation Planning: A Five Year Retrospective-Affiong Adanga, Rebecca Shum, Renee Alexander

Mr. Joel Ettinger said that the September 11th Memorial Program for Regional Transportation Planning was a living memorial of Ignatius Adanga, Charles Lesperance and See Wong Shum, the three NYMTC staff members who lost their lives due to the terrorist attack on the World Trade Center on September 11, 2001. He expressed his condolences for the 84 Port Authority employees who also lost their lives. He noted that the program provided assistance to students and organizations for projects in both the academic and public policy arenas as a way to educate and motivate those who are interested in transportation technology and planning and was comprised with a planning component and an academic component. He then noted that a report was developed titled, “September 11th Memorial Program for Regional Transportation Planning: A Five Year Retrospective- Planning and Academic Initiatives”, that included comments from the family members, staff members along with a listing of student participant achievements, and encouraged everyone to pick up the document at the sign-in table.

Family Members

Ms. Affiong Adanga, wife of the late Ignatius Adanga, spoke about how she was deeply humbled by the actions of the NYMTC employees in honoring their colleague who lost their lives from the attacks on September 11, 2001 with the September 11th Memorial Program. Ms. Adanga message to the audience, “although we cannot control things that happen around us, we can control the way that we respond to it.” She said that she doesn’t take anything for granted anymore and she lives each day as if she might not see the next minute. She thanked the NYMTC staff and the members of the Council for all they have done to honor Ignatius, Charles and See-Wong. She said words could not express what was in her heart but the employees of NYMTC actions have humbled and honored her and her family.

Ms. Rebecca Shum, wife of the late See Wong Shum, said that she may feel drained and exhausted but she regains her strength and become stronger to always say yes to continue on. She said that Shum was a high school teacher and said his message was very clear—“the biggest asset is knowledge, not the inheritance.” Rebecca said it was hard to assess and rank the applicants who applied to the September 11th Memorial Program for Regional Transportation Planning because the work and the credentials of the applicants were outstanding. She said that the recipients over the years were truly rising stars of the transportation sector and they will continue to make successful paths in the names of Shum, Ignatius and Charles. Rebecca shared that her children have grown to become strong, young, beautiful teenagers and she will make sure that they will continue to enjoy life and live their lives well with their biggest inheritance that their Dad had left for them which was knowledge. She was thankful for the meeting invitation and for allowing her to share her thoughts.

Ms. Renee Alexander, fiancée of Charles Lesperance, said that the past days had been an emotional and astonishing experience. She said, “Once these emotions become uncorked, it’s really hard to put them in” giving a description of re-corking a champagne bottle. She said that she had been connected with NYMTC and the September 11th Memorial Program that encourages education. She reflected how Charles was inquisitive and enjoyed lifelong learning and said it was an important concept of the program. She said that she could not think of a better memorial for the three men who all emphasized education. She said that she felt like she’s a part of the NYMTC family because she was included throughout the process of developing the scholarship program. She said that if the program continued to identify, recruit and support the best and brightest students, it would continue to be a better living memorial for the lives lost on September 11, 2001.

Mr. Gerry Bogacz thanked the families for being present and said that they were symbols of courage and resilience. He then talked about the program. Mr. Bogacz said that the September 11th Memorial Program for Regional Transportation Planning was managed through federal dollars and noted that the program not only acknowledged the loss of the NYMTC staff members but also the staff of NYMTC's member agency, the Port Authority of New York & New Jersey (PANYNJ), which lost 84 employees on September 11, 2001. He acknowledged Lou Venech, PANYNJ's PFAC representative, as one of many who helped NYMTC to get back on track and thanked him for being there throughout the entire process. He said that the program's planning initiative solicited innovative planning projects, ideas from municipalities, not for profits organizations, academic institutions, community and civic groups located within NYMTC's planning area to attempt to revitalize the planning process. He said the three proposals that were chosen through a competitive process were: "Air Quality and Transportation in the New York Metropolitan Area" proposed by Manhattan College and sponsored by the Rockland County Planning Department; "Transportation and Land Use in the NYMTC Region: Strengthening Urban-Suburban Coordination", proposed by the Rudin Center for Transportation Policy and Management at the NYU Wagner School in conjunction with the University Transportation Research Center and sponsored by NYMTC; and "Hunts Point Green Fleets Study" proposed by the Hunts Point Economic Development Corporation and sponsored by the New York City Department of Transportation. A complete description of all projects are produced in the "September 11 Memorial Program for Regional Transportation Plan: A Five Year Retrospective-Planning and Academic Initiatives" report that was available on the sign-in table.

Mr. Joel Ettinger noted that the academic component for the September 11th Memorial Program would not have been possible without the University Transportation Research Center, (UTRC). He said NYMTC members and staff worked closely with UTRC staff to develop the academic element of the program.

University Transportation Research Center

Mr. Robert "Buz" Paaswell, Director Emeritus of the University Transportation Research Center, (UTRC) Region 2, noted that the UTRC, as a U.S. Department of Transportation Regional Transportation Center that consisted of a consortium of 16 universities in New York, New Jersey and Puerto Rico that brought together a diverse and collective array of talent, a wealth of cutting edge ideas with the obligation to do research, academics and training on technology in the field of transportation. He said staff and students of UTRC had a collegial relationship who staff worked at the World Trade Center (WTC) with NYMTC and the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey, working side by side on particular problems in the region that made being at the WTC not an iconic building but instead, made the WTC a living dynamic place of people. He said that the UTRC and NYMTC looked at the success of Charles, Ignatius and See-Wong who represented dedication, professionalism and the love of work to their colleagues, and developed a competitive program that dealt with difficult New York problems and matched students with faculty advisors, NYMTC staff and family members, to begin a legacy for the next generation of people being trained. He noted that the program has become very competitive and students who participated in the program have achieved enough to make their mark in solving problems in the region.

Ms. Penny Eickemeyer, Assistant Director for Program Management, UTRC, noted that Rebecca Shum, Affiong Adanga and Renee Alexander were instrumental in the planning and development of the living memorial to honor their loved ones. She said that UTRC joined with NYMTC and its member agencies to create the September 11th Memorial Program for Regional Transportation Planning. She noted that UTRC was given a continued role in the project because they were going to be ongoing administrators to the academic initiative. She said that the academic component of the program provided financial support and an opportunity for qualified student from the UTRC consortium schools, to engage in research either independently or through a supervised internship at a NYMTC member agency. She explained how candidates are selected through a rigorous review process and she thanked the family members for their involvement. She said that the topics selected varied with the requirement that the topic reflected the regional transportation needs and the topics had to be consistent with the goals of NYMTC's Regional Transportation Plan. She said that five years of the program had been completed, 22 students representing seven schools had finished the program, and several students from the program were currently working in the region, completing their Ph.D.'s, or working on the federal level. She said that a few international

students returned to their homeland and applied what they have learned from the program to their country's transportation needs. Ms. Eickemeyer referenced that the "September 11 Memorial Program for Regional Transportation Plan: A Five Year Retrospective-Planning and Academic Initiatives" report contained detailed information about the program and the projects the students had worked on.

Student Participants – Past and Present

Ms. Li Chen, City College of New York engineering student, was one of the first year participants of the program September 11th Memorial Program who worked on the West Side Manhattan Traffic and Transportation Study at the NYC Department of Transportation. Ms. Chen said that she was greatly honored for being selected to participate in the program. She said that becoming involved in many aspects of this project enhanced her education. She said the program was a great starting point towards her Ph.D. studies and the experience was very valuable. She said that she would contribute towards transportation in New York City with her future research efforts and professional activities. She expressed her deepest gratitude to NYMTC and UTRC.

Mr. Richard Barone, Columbia University Urban Planning student and one of the second year participants of the program worked with NYMTC's Technical Group to develop a five part strategy to formalize data management practices at NYMTC. Mr. Barone was thankful to NYMTC, UTRC and the family members for the opportunity and said it was a great experience. He currently works for the Regional Plan Association as a research and policy planning for transportation.

Mr. Gitakrishnan Ramadurai, Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute Engineering student and third year participant of the program conducted an independent research project titled, "Identification and Modeling of Next Generation Traveler Guidance Systems." He received his Ph.D. in Civil Engineering and accepted a position as Assistant Professor in Transportation Engineering in the Department of Civil Engineering, Indian Institute of Technology, in Madras, India. Mr. Ramadurai was not available to be present for the meeting but his status report was read by Ms. Eickemeyer.

Mr. Peter Feroe, New York University Urban Planning student and fourth year participant of the program worked with the Westchester County Department of Transportation (WDOT), focusing on Transit-Oriented-Development opportunities in the I-287 Corridor. He said that the program benefited him because he learned about the federal process, transit planning, and what it takes to put together large projects. He said he developed a better understanding between communities and their transit systems and benefited from the opportunity to work in a professional planning department alongside great planning colleagues. He thanked his professional advisor Ed Burroughs of WDOT and his academic advisor Ingrid Could Ellen of NYU for being a great resource. Mr. Feroe took a position with Metropolitan Transportation Authority Bus as a Sustainability Analyst. He said thank NYMTC and UTRC for affording him the opportunity to gain knowledge and skills during the program which helped him to better prepare to tackle the transportation challenges in the region.

Ms. Sandra Rothbard, New York University Urban Planning student and fifth year participant of the program worked with the PANYNJ to promote community involvement in freight decision-making. Ms. Rothbard said that it was very clear that the program was not just another fellowship, internship or scholarship program but was a special competitive program that honored three very important individuals that were leading professionals in the transportation field. Ms. Rothbard, a Fellow in the Mayor's Office of Long-Term Planning and Sustainability, had accepted a position in the Office of Freight Mobility within the New York City Department of Transportation. She credits her career opportunity to the program. She said the program offered wonderful opportunities for student with interest in the transportation field and appreciated the opportunity.

Mr. Cyrus Naheedy, Polytechnic Institute of New York University Transportation Planning and Engineering student was awarded an internship for the 2011-2012 program year. Mr. Naheedy will intern with the PANYNJ on the Regional Airport Ground Access Modeling project to enhance the model into a more comprehensive tool that meets longer-term needs of the region. Mr. Naheedy said that it felt amazing and he was grateful to be a participant. He said that the impact of September 11th was tangible to him and was

honored to receive the award.

Ms. Shuai Ren, New York University Urban Planning student, was also awarded an internship for the current year with the NYC Department of Transportation Planning & Sustainability Division working on Pop-up Cafes and Public Bench projects to provide outdoor public seating in curb lanes, promote local business, and to expand the availability of fixed public seating on NYC streets that would support transit and walking. Ms. Ren said that she was excited to be apart of the project and will contribute her knowledge she gained from school towards it and learn from the practice. She was thankful for the opportunity.

Mr. Maxwell Sokol, Columbia University Graduate School of Architecture, Planning and Preservation student, will intern with NYMTC to focus on developing an asset-based Infrastructure needs database comprised of an inventory of all components of the transportation system for NYMTC's 2015-2040 Regional Transportation Plan. Mr. Sokol said it's very hard to articulate how grateful he is to be awarded the opportunity to participate in the September 11th Memorial Program but hopeful that his gratitude would show through his work. He said that it was an honor and a privilege to carry on the legacy of Ignatius, Charles and See-Wong and with great pride he dedicated his work to their loved ones.

Ms. Daysi Manzano, Baruch College Public Management student, interned during the summer with NYMTC 's Planning Unit reviewing federal questions and comments on the long-range financial assessment in NYMTC Regional Transportation Plan (RTP) and applied the research and information towards the development of the financial assessment in NYMTC's next year RTP. Ms. Manzano said that she hoped that the students of the program would continue improve the transportation system of New York.

C. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT –

Mr. Joel Ettinger said that the report from Alice Greenwald, comments made by the families and updates from the students had made the program so amazing and inspiring.

Mr. Ettinger said since July, 2011, the members adopted a Transportation Improvement Program through 2015. He said a revised funding allocation was received from the New York State Department of Transportation which projected funding that was more consistent with the various legislative proposals seen in the reauthorization of the federal program. He said that members were currently reviewing the revised allocation and would formulate a series of TIP amendments to maintain fiscal constraint of the TIP. He said that staff would update the emissions analysis to reflect the amendments and by June 2012, a new Transportation Conformity Determination should be ready to be adopted.

D. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Fred Shotkin paid tribute to his personal friend who lost his life in the September 11, 2001 attacks. He said that the Taxi of Tomorrow program was a bad idea, but the introduction of a new cab was good. He said that cycle plan was a very good plan that helped cyclists. He said that he was unhappy that the Metropolitan Transportation Authority's Chairman Jay Walder would be leaving the agency.

Joseph Clift said that he had been to several meetings and each one had a portion that was dedicated to the September 11, 2001 remembrance but the NYMTC meeting was much more personal and focused. He then delivered his remarks. He asked how many of the members were concerned about capital constraints on capital funding in the region. Mr. Clift submitted the attached statement requesting the members not to approve PFAC Resolution #333, Adoption of the Consensus 2040 Population and Employment Forecasts.

George Haikalis, President of the Institute of Rational Urban Mobility, Inc. (IRUM) thanked the committee for the opportunity to participate in the commemorative event. He expressed his condolences to the families and commended the staff survivors for their dedication to continue the planning process in the desperate dark hours.

George Haikalis said that in regards to the Amtrak Gateway Project, the Metropolitan Transportation

Authority, New Jersey Transit and Amtrak were collectively working on a mutual operational analysis but it was unfortunate that there was no public outreach component. He said the logical forum would be NYMTC's Metropolitan Mobility Network to get this project up and adopted. He talked about the rebuilding of Penn Station Moynihan Station and said there was no agency identified as being in charge and NYMTC and NJTPA needed to deal with this project aggressively. He said that New York was in a competition with the rest of the world for financial services and depended on a high quality transportation system. He urged the Council to come up with a collective way do something about it.

E. ACTION ITEMS

1. ACCEPT: July 28, 2011 MEETING SYNOPSIS

A motion to accept the July 28, 2011 Meeting Synopsis was made by Mr. Jack Schmidt, representing the New York City Transportation Coordinating Committee, and seconded by Ms. Naomi Klein, representing the Mid-Hudson South Transportation Coordinating Committee. The meeting synopsis was unanimously accepted.

2. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #333 – ADOPTION OF THE CONSENSUS 2040 POPULATION AND EMPLOYMENT FORECASTS

Ms. Sangeeta Bhowmick, NYMTC's Acting Technical Director, said the purpose of the resolution was to adhere to federal regulations by preparing long-term socioeconomic and demographic forecasts and population and employment forecasts for the NYMTC region. She said that through the Forecasting Working Group, a consensus had been reached on new county-level forecast of population and employment though a 2040 horizon year with the understanding that it will be used as appropriate for all of NYMTC's required products and analyses.

A motion to adopt Resolution #333, Adoption of the Consensus 2040 Population and Employment Forecasts was made by Mr. William Wheeler, representing the Metropolitan Transportation Authority, and seconded by Mr. Garry Lenberger, representing the Nassau/Suffolk Transportation Coordinating Committee. The resolution unanimously passed.

3. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #334 – AMENDMENTS TO THE 2010-2035 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLAN

Mr. Jan Khan of NYMTC staff said the purpose of the resolution was to make necessary amendments to the financial analysis of the Regional Transportation Plan (RTP). He said the Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) was an integral part of the RTP so when changes occur in the TIP, changes need to also be made in the financial analysis.

A motion to adopt Resolution #334, Amendments to the 2010-2035 Regional Transportation Plan was made by Ms. Naomi Klein, representing the Mid-Hudson South Transportation Coordinating Committee, and seconded by Mr. Jack Schmidt, representing New York City Transportation Coordinating Committee. The resolution unanimously passed.

4. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #335 – ADMINISTRATIVE REVISION TO THE 2011-2012 UNIFIED PLANNING WORK PROGRAM TO ADD PLANNING PROJECTS TO THE OTHER STUDIES SECTION

Mr. Stephen Hausch of NYMTC staff said that the purpose of the resolution was to make an administration revision to list transportation planning projects that appeared in the Federal Fiscal Year 2011 element of the Transportation Improvement Program in the Other Studies Section of the current Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP) to meet federal funding regulations. Mr. Hausch said that it did not impact or use UPWP funds.

A motion to adopt Resolution #335, Administrative Revision to the 2011-2012 Unified Planning Work Program to Add Planning Projects to the Other Studies Section was made by Ms. Robert Brickman, representing the Nassau/Suffolk Transportation Coordinating Committee, and seconded by Mr. John Pilner,

representing the Mid-Hudson South Transportation Coordinating Committee. The resolution unanimously passed.

F. CONFIRMATION OF NEXT PFAC MEETING

The next PFAC meeting was confirmed to be held on Thursday, November 17, 2011 at 1:15 p.m. at the NYMTC Office.

G. ADJOURN

The meeting was adjourned.

ATTENDANCE

Voting Members/Alternatives

Linda Bailey, New York City Department of Transportation
Robert Brickman, Nassau County Planning Commission
Patrick Gerdin, Rockland County Planning Department
Naomi Klein, Westchester County Department of Public Works & Transportation
Garry Lenberger, Suffolk County Department of Public Works
John Pilner, Putnam County Planning Department
Jack Schmidt, New York City Department of City Planning
William Wheeler, Metropolitan Transportation Authority
Robert Zerrillo, New York State Department of Transportation

Advisory (Non-Voting) Members

Nancy Danzig, Federal Transit Administration
Karen Rosenberger, Federal Highway Administration
Lou Venech, Port Authority of New York and New Jersey
Melanie Zeman, US Environmental Protection Agency

NYMTC Staff

Afolabi Aiyedun	Gary Forman	Larry McAuliffe
Voncille Anderson	Angelina Foster	Andrea Miles-Cole
Sangeeta Bhowmick	Emma Gaitan	Ali Mohseni
Gerry Bogacz	Maria Garcia	Kathy Moore
Thusitha Chandra	Anthony Gawrych	Larisa Morozovskaya
Ken Chin	Stephen Hausch	Shalendra Ramadhin
Lisa Daglian	Jan Khan	Chris Rodrigues-Moore
Nina DelSenno	John Lopez	Jean Shanahan
Joel Ettinger	Howard Mann	Maxwell Sokol
Oluseye Folarin	Daisy Manzano	

OTHER

Affiong Adanga	Walter Houston, LDCWB
Renee Alexander	Jennifer Irvin, Westchester County
Nadia Aslam, UTRC	Michael Levin, Town of North Hempstead
Richard Barone, RPA	Uchenna Madu, NYSDOT
Juliette Bergman	Nathalie Martinez, UTRC
Murray Bodin, Concerned Grandparents	John Mattera, NYCDPR
Dolores Buckenberger, Transystems	Cyris Neheedy, PANYNJ
Pam Burford, LIRR	Jim Newell, US Rail NY
Donald Burns, FTA	Robert Paaswell, UTRC
Joseph Brown, NYSDOT	Renee Peters-Smith, NYCDOT
Li Chen, CCNY	Ophelia Ray-Fenner, NYCDOT
Joseph Clift	Shuai Ren, NYU
Phil Eng, NYSDOT	Alan Ripps, NYCDOP
Penny Eickemeyer, UTRC	Sandra Rothbard, NYCDOT
Peter Feroe, MTA Bus	Yogesh Sanghvi, NYCDOT
Tatyana Golikova, NYSDOT	Matt Shotkin
Todd Goldman, PANYNJ	Rebecca Shum
Leon Goodman, ITE	Karin Sommer, NYCDOT
Alice Greenwald, Nat. 9/11 Memorial Museum	Heather Sporn, NYSDOT
Holly Haff, MNR	B. Stichin, FACCP
George Haikalis, IRUM	Jai Therattil, NYCDOT
Barry Herol, NYU	Vanis Trapp, NYCDOT

I certify that this September 15, 2011 Program, Finance and Administration Committee Meeting Synopsis was unanimously accepted by the members of PFAC at the November 17, 211 PFAC Meeting.

Respectfully Submitted,

*Andrea Miles-Cole
Secretary 2- NYMTC*